

University of Notre Dame Document Delivery



ILLiad TN: 650316

**Journal Title:** Colloquia Germanica

**Call #:** PD 1 .C714

**Volume:** 31

**Location:** 8

**Issue:**

**Month/Year:** 1998

**Pages:** 177-179

**Article Author:** Roche

**Article Title:** Book Review of "A Foretaste of Heaven." Friedrich Hölderlin in the Context of Württemberg Pietism, by Priscilla Hayden-Roy.

**CUSTOMER HAS REQUESTED:**

**Imprint:**

Mark Roche (mroche)  
Institute for Advanced Study  
1124 Flanner  
Notre Dame, IN 46556

DEC 12 2012

vant to women and women's studies» (iv). Furthermore, it differs from already existing bio-bibliographical works on women writers by focusing less on the lives of the authors and more on their position within the field of German studies. To this end, the encyclopedia not only discusses issues closely linked with literature, including literary theory and literary history, but also topics in related disciplines, such as film studies, history, music, fine arts, psychology and sociology.

Each entry includes an initial description of the topic, a discussion of feminist thought concerning it, a listing of related entries contained in the encyclopedia, and a brief bibliography. Besides the entries, which comprise 586 pages, the work consists of a preface, an introduction, an appendix of names, an index, and a list of contributors. The appendix of names is an alphabetical ordering of the people discussed in the encyclopedia, followed by their dates and the titles of other entries relevant to them. This feature allows the user to assess at a glance which topics provide information about a particular author. Names of individuals who receive their own entry are printed in bold, as are the page numbers of main entries in the index, helping the researcher access desired information quickly.

The range of subjects covered in this volume is very impressive. It extends from well known writers and topics (for example, Annette von Droste-Hülshoff and «Gruppe 47») to authors who are important but rarely if ever discussed in other reference works, such as Libuse Morfoková, Anna Ověna Hoyers, Dorothea Leporn-Erleben and Malvika von Meysenburg, and to topics that in all likelihood are being included for the first time in a literary encyclopedia, such as «Angestelltmännern» and «FBIZ (Frauenforschungs- Bildungs- und Informationszentrum)», «masculinity and postmodernism», «soap opera» and «subjective authenticity.» Other examples of relatively new or underrepresented topics the work contains are «essentialism/constructionism», «Gestaltungsethik», «Mannweib», «minority literature» and «Queer Theory.» The volume also covers traditional literary periods and genres (such as Romanticism, Realism, Bildungsroman, etc.), and discusses the lives and work of male authors and philosophers whenever doing so provides a better understanding of women's contributions. This reviewer could think of few subjects or people pertinent to German studies that were not included in the index.

Many of the over 120 contributors to this volume were recruited through *Women in German*, a U.S.-based organization whose influence on the development of feminist scholarship in German literature has been great. Additionally, the editors invited submissions from experts in other fields related to German studies. Despite the large number of contributing scholars from various disciplines, the editors sought to establish a relative coherence among the texts while preserving «the individual style and character of each entry» (viii). This goal has for the most part been met, although occasionally an entry exhibits scholarship that is weaker than the skillfully crafted research characteristic of the vast majority of articles. There is also the occasional inclusion of language that dates an entry and that therefore should be avoided in an encyclopedia, such as reference to Christa Wolf's «recent» attempt to find anonymity in California.

This encyclopedia contains a long overdue assessment of women's contributions to German literature, film, history and related disciplines that is both refreshing and

necessary. It is an important addition to the field of German studies, and should be of interest to high school, college and university libraries in the United States and beyond, as well as to many individuals. Indeed, it provides feminist scholars of German literature with the reference work they have always wanted.

West Virginia University

Deborah Janson

PRISCILLA A. HAYDEN-ROY: «*A Foretaste of Heaven. » Friedrich Hölderlin in the Context of Württemberg Pietism.* Amsterdamer Publikationen zur Sprache und Literatur 114. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 1994. 308 pp. Hfl.90 or \$56.00.

Priscilla Hayden-Roy's revised dissertation (Washington University, 1988) is a very useful work for scholars interested in the cultural-historical roots of Hölderlin's writings. Hayden-Roy argues that the influence of pietism on Hölderlin was less virulent than has previously been thought. Most of the relevant literature assumes that Hölderlin «absorbed the speculative thought of such pietists as Bengel and Oetinger at an early age, and then transformed it into secularized or religiously syncretistic forms in his poetic and theoretical writings» (3). Hayden-Roy sees more complexity in Württemberg pietism than has been assumed and fewer paths from the more interesting speculative pietists to Hölderlin. She would break up the simplistic narrative of previous scholars «in favor of a non-teleological intertextuality of competing discourses» (16).

The first main chapter, «The Context of Württemberg Pietism,» investigates the conflicting voices within Württemberg pietism. Württemberg pietism differs from the pietism of Zinzendorf and the Moravian Brethren in the North and has two distinct wings, the speculative wing, which included Oetinger and represented a minority, and the more pronounced, orthodox Spenerian wing. Instead of offering an overview of pietism, Hayden-Roy gives brief sketches of the lives, thought, and pietist activities of seven pietist pastors in Württemberg. Four pietists are chosen who were prominent in the group and represent a spectrum of views. These include Bengel, the «father» of Württemberg pietism; two speculative thinkers, Oetinger and Hahn; and one conservative thinker, Roos. Three pietists known to have had contact with Hölderlin in his youth and as a student are also discussed: Nürtingen pastors Köstlin and Klemm, and the Tübingen seminar tutor, Dann. Though the speculative pietists were more original and more similar to Hölderlin, they were not representative of Württemberg pietism as a whole. More importantly, the pietists most in a position to influence the younger Hölderlin were, in Hayden-Roy's analysis, less likely to have mediated speculative pietist ideas than has previously been assumed. Sermons and other extant documents reveal that speculative ideas were either absent or appear in ambiguous form. Dominant ideas of the orthodox pietists, including their elevation of institutional religion and their quietism, were distant from Hölderlin's emerging thinking.

Hayden-Roy argues that some positions normally identified with Oetinger may be simply analogous to Hölderlin's thinking and could well have come from other sources. Prominent examples are Oetinger's monism, including his polemics against any privileging of spirit over body; his rejection of eternal damnation and elevation of

the *apokatastasis panton*, or the restitution of all things; and his early valuation of *Zentralerkenntnis*, or the mystical vision of the unity of all things. Each of these positions is also visible in late Enlightenment philosophy and theology. Even the ideas of the conservative pietists closer to Hölderlin, such as the importance of the subjective intensity of religious experience, could have been gained from other thinkers; moreover, the pietists combined such insights with conformity to orthodox doctrine and institutions and in this sense differed significantly from Hölderlin. Some thoughts of the pietists in Nürtingen may have influenced Hölderlin: Köstlin's emphasis on finding peace in Christ, the attitude of waiting and expectancy vis-à-vis the coming eschatological fulfillment, and the importance of self-examination; or Klemm's notion of the presence of the divine in nature. However, this hypothesis is countered with the sober assessment that these thoughts could have been engendered in any number of contexts. Hayden-Roy thus speaks carefully of a «predisposition» toward certain ideas that may have been generated by Hölderlin's exposure to the pietists (132).

The other main chapter, «Hölderlin in the Context of Württemberg Pietism,» investigates selections of Hölderlin's writings. In the early writings Hayden-Roy sees pietist influence in themes such as the denunciation of the world and stillness, though these too have other potential sources. Moreover, under the influence of Klopstock, religious models often give way to aesthetic ones, and Hölderlin embraces an enthusiastic anthropology that differs from the orthodox pietist view. Speculative pietist theology is absent. In the Tübingen years, Hölderlin distanced himself dramatically from the idea that the church could renew humanity. His moonism during this period and his vision of love are read as being analogous to, but not derivative of, speculative pietism. In *Hyperion* we recognize even more so Hölderlin's rejection of the institutional church as the true locus of religion. The embrace of unity and of eschatology, which bears similarity to Oetinger, is read in the light of «a larger philosophical undercurrent in the 18th century» (243). In Hölderlin's poetics, the idea that spirit manifests itself through matter also parallels Oetinger's thought, but here too the potential sources are multiple. Moreover, Oetinger differs in his elevation of positive revelation. In his late poetry Hölderlin elevates the concrete and stable and develops thereby a more generous view of institutions, but this reevaluation takes place within a universalistic philosophy and so differs from the pietists' exclusive elevation of the Christian tradition.

Although Hayden-Roy's volume appears to be meticulous in its archival research and sober sifting of the issue of pietist influence on Hölderlin, I have three modest criticisms. First, to prove noninfluence is very difficult. We are not left with the claim that the pietists did not influence Hölderlin, but with the more modest claim that pietist influence was not as simple or as direct as is sometimes believed. The origins in Hölderlin's thought of the *apokatastasis panton*, for example, remain unclear. Klemm did accept this idea, even though Hayden-Roy does not find among the meager materials available evidence of his promoting the view publicly. Much of the negative argument remains as speculative as the positive argument concerning influence. In addition, one potential source for this idea is the pietistically influenced Schleiermacher, whose *Reden über die Religion* Hölderlin possessed. Second, influenced by new historicism, Hayden-Roy is eager to show radical discontinuities among the pietists; this

is wise and represents progress in criticism, but the desire to escape the overarching narrative prevents her from reflecting in any systematic way on the most essential common denominators of Württemberg pietism, which cannot be denied even as we recognize the variety of individual positions. Third, sometimes a work of production aesthetics influences our interpretation not only of the origins, but also of the meaning and form of an author's work; unfortunately, this volume has little impact on artwork aesthetics and has for this sphere only peripheral importance.

The book has great value as a work of intellectual and social history. Hayden-Roy's account of Hölderlin in the context of Württemberg pietism contributes significantly to our understanding of the diversity of Württemberg pietism. The book reevaluates previously assumed direct influences and reformulates such apparent influences as intellectual analogies, informed by the *Zeitszeit*. Finally, it successfully sifts the differences between Hölderlin and the pietists.

University of Notre Dame

Mark W. Roche

JOHN BLAIR: *Tracing Subversive Currents in Goethe's Wilhelm Meister's Apprenticeship*. Columbia, SC: Camden House, 1997. 204 pp. \$54.95

We have here another study, a revised 1994 Indiana University dissertation, that undermines what we used to accept as the gospel truth, i.e., that *Wilhelm Meisters Lehrjahre* was the model *Bildungsroman* and that its protagonist was at least on the right track at the end of the novel. With Mikhail Bakhtin as one of his guides, John Blair discovers, below the middle and upper class values that used to inform the *Bildungsroman* ideals, the more attractive world of the market place, the traveling theater group, the comic characters, and the disenfranchised in general. For the author, Wilhelm is most himself when he is part of the community of actors and actresses, when he is, like Friedrich, left to his own devices by the Tower (Blair's word for the «Turngesellschaft»). It is this world that Shakespeare's plays represent best, being equally in tune with «low» and «high» culture.

Traditionally, the *Lehrjahre* readers have favored the values represented by the middle and upper classes but a close look at the text reveals that there are many indications that the world of the lower classes, with its spontaneity, carefree life, sensuality, free love, disorder, dirt is at least as much, if not more, valorized in the novel. In Blair's socially oriented analysis the aristocracy, the abbé, and even Wilhelm come in for severe criticism. They stand for rationality, order, status quo, authoritarianism, Enlightenment. They try to impose their own life style on that of the lower classes, and they are interested only in solidifying their position of power.

Some of these points have been made before (Karl Schlechta, Heinz Schlaffer) but the evidence Blair finds in the *Lehrjahre* supporting his interpretation is exhaustive. Characters from the lower classes fare consistently better in the author's eyes than those of the nobility. A case in point is Philine with her generous giving away both of herself and her possessions and her enjoying life. Her opposite is the colorless Natalie whose educational endeavors are repeatedly criticized for preparing women to